



Control Number: 51023



Item Number: 535

Addendum StartPage: 0

SOAH DOCKET NO. 473-21-0247
PUC DOCKET NO. 51023



APPLICATION OF THE CITY OF SAN § BEFORE THE STATE OFFICE
ANTONIO ACTING BY AND THROUGH §
THE CITY PUBLIC SERVICE BOARD §
(CPS ENERGY) TO AMEND ITS §
CERTIFICATE OF CONVENIENCE § OF
AND NECESSITY FOR THE PROPOSED §
SCENIC LOOP 138-KV TRANSMISSION §
LINE IN BEXAR COUNTY § ADMINISTRATIVE HEARINGS

DIRECT TESTIMONY OF CARLOS J. GARCIA AND CHRISTINA M. GARCIA
ON BEHALF OF CLEARWATER RANCH POA

Intervenors, Carlos J. Garcia and Christina M. Garcia, on Behalf of Clearwater Ranch POA ("Clearwater Ranch") files this Direct Testimony, which is attached. Clearwater Ranch stipulates that this Direct Testimony can be treated by all parties as if the answers were filed under oath.

Respectfully submitted,

BRAUN & GRESHAM, PLLC

P.O. Box 1148 (Mailing)
Dripping Springs, Texas 78620
14101 Hwy. 290 W., Bldg. 1100 (Physical)
Austin, Texas 78737
512-894-5426 (telephone)
512-894-3405 (fax)

/s/Patrick L. Reznik _____
Patrick L. Reznik
State Bar No. 16806780
preznik@braungresham.com
Carly Barton
State Bar No. 24086063
cbarton@braungresham.com

ATTORNEYS FOR CLEARWATER RANCH

535

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I certify that a copy of this document will be served on all parties of record on February 19, 2021, in accordance with Public Utility Commission Procedural Rule 22.74.

/s/Patrick L. Reznik _____
Patrick L. Reznik

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION	4
II.	PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF TESTIMONY	5
III.	DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY AND THE LINE’S IMPACT	6
IV.	CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS	9
	EXHIBIT A MAP OF PROPERTY	4, 8, 11

1 **I. INTRODUCTION**

2
3
4 QUESTION: PLEASE STATE YOUR NAME AND CURRENT ADDRESS FOR THE
5 RECORD.

6
7 ANSWER: Carlos and Christina Garcia, 25120 Clearwater Creek, San Antonio, TX 78255.
8
9

10 QUESTION: ARE YOU AN INTERVENOR IN SOAH DOCKET NO. 473-21-0247 AND PUC
11 DOCKET NO. 51023 AND ON WHOSE BEHALF ARE YOU TESTIFYING?
12

13 ANSWER: Yes. We are testifying on behalf of ourselves, Carlos J. Garcia and Christina M.
14 Garcia, and on behalf of Clearwater Ranch POA, which we fully support.
15
16

17 QUESTION: HAVE YOU EVER TESTIFIED IN A PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION OF
18 TEXAS ("PUC" OR "COMMISSION") PROCEEDING?
19

20 ANSWER: No.
21
22

23 QUESTION: BRIEFLY DESCRIBE YOUR OCCUPATION, EDUCATIONAL AND WORK
24 HISTORIES.
25

26 ANSWER: Carlos J. Garcia graduated from the University of North Carolina, Charlotte. He is the
27 owner of El Chaparral Mexican Restaurant and was a former professional soccer player. Christina
28 Garcia is a graduate of Incarnate Word University. She worked as a District Manager for
29 Abercrombie & Fitch.
30
31

32 QUESTION: WHERE IS YOUR PROPERTY LOCATED?
33

34 ANSWER: Our property is located at 25120 Clearwater Creek, San Antonio, TX 78255. Lot 17.
35

36 ***See Exhibit A.***
37

38 QUESTION: HOW LONG HAVE YOU OWNED THE PROPERTY?
39

40 ANSWER: We have owned the property for 3 years.
41
42

1 QUESTION: ARE YOU FAMILIAR WITH THIS AREA OF BEXAR COUNTY, TEXAS?

2
3 ANSWER: Yes. We have lived in Bexar County for over 30 years.

4
5
6 **II. PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF TESTIMONY**
7

8
9 QUESTION: WHAT IS THE PURPOSE AND SCOPE OF YOUR TESTIMONY?

10
11 ANSWER: The purpose of our testimony is to (a) describe our property; (b) describe the expected
12 impact of the proposed transmission line on our property; (c) voice our opposition against The City
13 of San Antonio, acting by and through the City Public Service Board ("CPS Energy"), using
14 Segments 25, 26a, 32, 37, 38, 39, and 43 and Routes F1, K, L, N1, P, Q1, R1, T1, U1, BB, and CC
15 which utilize these Segments; and (d) voice our support for Routes Z1 and AA1.

16
17
18 QUESTION: WHAT IS CLEARWATER RANCH POA'S CONCERNS ABOUT THE
19 PROPOSED TRANSMISSION LINE USING CPS ENERGY'S SEGMENTS 25, 26a, 37, 38, 39
20 AND 43 AND ROUTES F1, K, L, N1, P, Q1, R1, T1, U1, BB, AND CC?

21
22 ANSWER: In general, Clearwater Ranch is opposed to the construction of CPS Energy's
23 transmission line through their community because of the following: (1) a 138-kV transmission
24 line will severely depreciate the value of the Clearwater Ranch properties; (2) a 138-kV
25 transmission line will severely detract from the scenic beauty and aesthetic values of the
26 Clearwater Ranch properties and area; (3) a 138-kV transmission line would negatively impact
27 community, economic, and historical values and the character, ecology, and biology of Clearwater
28 Ranch's properties and area; (4) the Clearwater Ranch residents and visitors will have to drive
29 under or near a 138-kV transmission line on a regular basis; (5) for transmission lines crossing a
30 Clearwater Ranch property, they would be required to give third parties access to their properties,
31 which limits the privacy and control over our properties; (6) Clearwater Ranch has general
32 concerns about any buzzing of the 138-kV transmission line and general health and safety concerns
33 and concerns about living and being close to a 138-kV transmission line; and (7) we have gone to
34 great lengths to preserve native Texas Hill Country and have established guarantees to preserve
35 the natural native flora and fauna of the Texas Hill Country. A 138-kV transmission line would

1 utterly destroy the protections that we have established and destroy this portion of undeveloped
2 Hill Country.

3
4
5 **III. DESCRIPTION OF PROPERTY AND THE LINE'S IMPACT**
6

7
8 QUESTION: ARE THERE ANY HABITABLE STRUCTURES ON THE PROPERTY?
9

10 ANSWER: Yes, our home is on the property.
11

12
13 QUESTION: PLEASE DESCRIBE YOUR PROPERTY'S TERRAIN AND ITS
14 ECOLOGICAL OR BIOLOGICAL FEATURES.
15

16 ANSWER: It is a fully developed residential property with secluded peaceful views of the Hill
17 Country consisting of a mixture of oak, mountain cedar, and laurels and is the primary reason we
18 bought this lot.
19

20
21 QUESTION: PLEASE DESCRIBE YOUR PROPERTY'S CURRENT USES.
22

23 ANSWER: This property is our home where we reside with our children.
24

25
26 QUESTION: HAVE YOU OR YOUR FAMILY UNDERTAKEN ANY EFFORTS TO
27 RESTORE THE LAND OR THE ENVIRONMENTAL QUALITY OF THE PROPERTY?
28

29 ANSWER: Yes, we have protected natural oak trees by removing the cedar trees that were
30 impacting the large oaks. We have planted various natural grasses and have installed many
31 birdhouses on throughout the property.
32

33
34 QUESTION: ARE THERE ANY WATER WELL SITES ON THE PROPERTY? IF SO,
35 DESCRIBE THE GENERAL LOCATION.
36

37 ANSWER: Yes, there is one well site on the eastern portion of the property.
38

39
40 QUESTION: ARE THERE ANY GAS WELLS ON THE PROPERTY? IF SO, DESCRIBE
41 THE GENERAL LOCATION.

1
2 ANSWER: No.
3
4

5 QUESTION: ARE THERE ANY PIPELINE EASEMENTS ON THE PROPERTY? IF SO,
6 DESCRIBE THE GENERAL LOCATION.
7

8 ANSWER: No.
9
10

11 QUESTION: PLEASE DESCRIBE ANY PLANNED FUTURE USES OF YOUR PROPERTY
12 IF THOSE USES ARE DIFFERENT FROM THE CURRENT USES PREVIOUSLY
13 DESCRIBED.
14

15 ANSWER: This will be our future retirement home where we plan to have livestock.
16
17

18 QUESTION: DO ANY EXISTING TRANSMISSION OR DISTRIBUTION LINES CROSS
19 YOUR PROPERTY? IF SO, PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW AND WHERE THEY CROSS THE
20 PROPERTY.
21

22 ANSWER: Yes, there is a CPS electric line, which our neighborhood went to great expense to
23 bury underground to preserve the natural beauty of the area. In addition, at the southern portion of
24 the property there are exposed power lines that run across the rear of the property.
25
26

27 QUESTION: ARE THERE CURRENT PLANS FOR OTHER UTILITY FEATURES ON
28 YOUR PROPERTY? IF SO, PLEASE DESCRIBE HOW AND WHERE THEY CROSS THE
29 PROPERTY.
30

31 ANSWER: No.
32
33

34 QUESTION: WOULD THE LINKS THAT MIGHT IMPACT YOUR PROPERTY RUN
35 ALONG ANY BOUNDARY LINES OF YOUR PROPERTY?
36

37 ANSWER: Yes. Segment 37, while not on our property is very close to our home and would run
38 along the entire length of the northern boundary. Proposed Segment 26a would be on our property
39 and run the entire length of our western property boundary. This Segment would be devastating to

1 the investment we have made in preserving the natural integrity of the environment on the property.

2 **See Exhibit A.**

3
4
5 QUESTION: HOW WOULD A 138-KV ELECTRIC TRANSMISSION LINE IMPACT YOUR
6 PROPERTY AND ITS OPERATIONS?

7
8 ANSWER: Segments 37 and 26a would destroy hundreds of trees stripping the property of all its
9 natural beauty. The habitat and wildlife that reside here would be ruined. In additions, the proposed
10 transmission line would be very close to our home.

11
12
13 QUESTION: WOULD YOU HAVE TO REGULARLY DRIVE UNDER THE
14 TRANSMISSION LINE IF INSTALLED ON YOUR PROPERTY.

15
16 ANSWER: Yes, proposed Segment 37 would cross directly over our street to the entrance of our
17 home. **See Exhibit A.**

18
19
20 QUESTION: DESCRIBE THE AESTHETIC IMPACT TO YOUR PROPERTY IF CPS
21 ENERGY BUILDS A 138-KV TRANSMISSION LINE ON YOUR PROPERTY.

22
23 ANSWER: We specifically moved here to get away from large power lines and to enjoy the scenic
24 views our property provides. It would destroy the peaceful serene views that we enjoy every day.
25 Both proposed Segments would devalue our property in ways that words or money cannot even
26 describe. I pray that CPS would respect and strongly consider not running these lines through our
27 hidden gem in the Clearwater Ranch community.

28
29
30 QUESTION: IF THE TRANSMISSION LINE IS BUILT ON YOUR PROPERTY, DO YOU
31 HAVE ANY CONCERNS ABOUT CPS ENERGY HAVING ACCESS TO YOUR PROPERTY?

32
33 ANSWER: Yes, we have the general concerns of landowners who are required to give third parties
34 access to their property. Also, this would materially affect the use of our property. We hope that
35 CPS will respect my property.

1
2 QUESTION: IF THE TRANSMISSION LINE IS BUILT ON YOUR PROPERTY, DO YOU
3 HAVE ANY OTHER CONCERNS?
4

5 ANSWER: We have general safety and health concerns for living around transmission lines and
6 EMF issues. Because potential buyers may be aware of medical studies available on the Internet
7 arguing, correctly or not, a connection between high-powered transmission lines causing health
8 problems and possible cancer, we are concerned about a negative stigma being attached to our
9 property and the possible devaluation of our property value. In addition, the buzzing sounds
10 emanating from high-voltage transmission lines would be bothersome for people living near them.
11

12
13 QUESTION: IS THERE ANYTHING ELSE YOU WOULD LIKE THE ADMINISTRATIVE
14 LAW JUDGE AND THE PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION TO CONSIDER IN THIS
15 PROCEEDING?
16

17 ANSWER: Yes, we recently purchased this property for the many reasons I have mentioned above
18 and we would hate for all of the beauty and wildlife habitat to be destroyed by these unsightly
19 transmission lines.
20

21
22 DO YOU HAVE ANY CONCERNS ABOUT SEGMENT 42a THAT IS UTILIZED IN ROUTES
23 Z1 AND AA1?
24

25 ANSWER: No, while our children attend McAndrew Elementary of Northside Independent
26 School District, this segment does not cross the entrances/exit, is the behind the school, and away
27 from where the children play.
28

29
30 **IV. CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS**
31

32
33 QUESTION: HOW WOULD YOU SUMMARIZE YOUR POSITION IN THIS PROCEEDING
34 REGARDING CPS ENERGY'S PROPOSED ALTERNATIVE ROUTES F1, K, L, N1, P, Q1,
35 R1, T1, U1, BB, AND CC AND CPS ENERGY'S PREFERRED ROUTES Z1 AND AA1?
36

37 ANSWER: We oppose CPS Energy's Alternative Routes F1, K, L, N1, P, Q1, R1, T1, U1, BB,
38 and CC and any Route using Segments 25, 26a, 32, 37, 38, 39, and 43. We support CPS Energy's

1 Routes Z1 and AA1 as the route(s) that best meet(s) the overall community values and PURA §
2 37.056(c)(4) and P.U.C. SUBST. R. 25.101(b)(3)(B).

3
4 QUESTION: DOES THIS CONCLUDE YOUR TESTIMONY?

5
6 ANSWER: Yes.



GARCIA CARLOS J & CHRISTINA - Lot 17
+/- 11.0200 Acres - Bexar County

