



Control Number: 38354



Item Number: 3252

Addendum StartPage: 0

Barry T. Smitherman
Chairman

Donna L. Nelson
Commissioner

Kenneth W. Anderson, Jr.
Commissioner



COPY

Rick Perry
Governor

Public Utility Commission of Texas

November 10, 2010

Mr. John Schattel
10317 Donley Drive
Irving, TX 75063

Re: Docket No. 38354; SOAH Docket No. 473-10-5546

Dear Mr. Schattel:

Thank you for sharing your correspondence regarding the LCRA TSC's proposed 345-kV transmission line project from McCamey D to Kendall to Gillespie.

Because this is an active case, we cannot discuss any substantive issues with you. However, your letter has been filed in Docket No. 38354 so that all parties are aware of your comments.

Future correspondence regarding this project should be directed to the following address:

*Public Utility Commission of Texas
Attn: Filing Clerk
1701 North Congress Avenue
Post Office Box 13326
Austin, TX 78711-3326*

Sincerely,

Three handwritten signatures are present. The first signature is for Barry T. Smitherman, the second for Donna L. Nelson, and the third for Kenneth W. Anderson, Jr.

Barry T. Smitherman
Chairman

Donna L. Nelson
Commissioner

Kenneth W. Anderson, Jr.
Commissioner



Printed on recycled paper

An Equal Opportunity Employer

1701 N. Congress Avenue PO Box 13326 Austin, TX 78711 512/936-7000 Fax: 512/936-7003 web site: www.puc.state.tx.us

3252

38354

John Schattel
10317 Donley Drive
Irving, TX 75063

November 3, 2010

Commissioner Barry Smitherman, Chair
Texas Public Utility Commission
1701 N. Congress Avenue
P. O. Box 13326
Austin, TX 78711 - 3326

Sir:

I am writing concerning the reference case: SOAH Docket #473-10-5546, PUC Docket #38354.

I would like to let you know that I am opposed to the approval of PUC staff "preferred" route recommendation MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate. I am opposed for the following reasons.

Comparison of PUC Staff "Preferred" Route MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate (through TLR) with LCRA "Preferred" Route MK 13

MK15 Modified /MK 15 Alternate

MK 13

Longer - 144.14 miles

134.99 miles

Costs more - \$302.3 million

\$266.7 million

Has 54 habitable structures within 500 ft

18 structures

(13 are on TLR which equates to 25%)

(Difference between 18 and 54 is an increase of 250%)

Is within 10,000 ft of 1 FAA airport

No airports

Is within 20,000 ft of 3 FAA airports

No airports

Is in proximity of 16 private airstrips

6 private airstrips

Is within 2000 ft of 13 electronic installations

2 elec. installations

Is within 1000 ft of 47 archeological/historical sites

13 arch/hist sites

After looking at the above comparison, it only makes sense to use either the MK 13 option or one of the other alternate routes being proposed.

I am also opposed to implementation of PUC staff "preferred" route recommendation MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate for the following additional reasons:

Other Important Information

- Commercial property, or potentially commercial properties along I-10, were given more preference over residential property by the PUC staff, which has not been the case in previous route recommendations
- TLR is a residential subdivision/community of 370 tracts ranging in size from 5 to 10 acres (total of 2629 acres) plus common property for use by all residents. All tracts have been sold (none remain for sale). We have 276 habitable structures, at this time, with approximately 500 residents (average of 2 per household)

2

- 13 houses on TLR will be directly impacted and at least 2 homes will be destroyed
- Based upon Gillespie Co. Appraisal District data, a route across TLR would likely decrease property values by at least 10%, over \$12 million (based on information related to the NextEra - Florida Power and Light Line east of us on White Oak Rd)
- Because the route will parallel the gas pipeline right-of-way, it will cross some of the higher elevations of the Pedernales and Guadalupe watersheds and the nearly 200 ft towers will be visible to and impact a significantly greater number of residents in the area than the 54 identified by LCRA.
- The NextEra lines which are almost half the height of the LCRA proposed lines are visible for miles around, even from the north end of TLR.
- There are safety concerns about installing a transmission line in the near vicinity of an old gas pipeline. The pipeline was installed in 1975. There have been explosions in the summer of 2010 in Texas and California while utility crews were digging around gas pipelines. There is also concern with aerial maintenance if the transmission lines are along the pipeline.
- There are concerns with erosion of privately maintained roads on TLR due to heavy equipment used in installation/maintenance of transmission lines.
- Texas Parks and Wildlife does not agree that MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate is the best alternative, as it will have the same adverse impact on wildlife habitat and other natural resources as the MK 13 route. It opposes the route because 72% of MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate would cut across unfragmented wildlife habitat on the Edwards Plateau. Accord. to TPWD, it will have an irreversible and irretrievable impact. The MK33 (I-10 route) has by far the most fragmented wildlife habitat and it would be worse to cut a corridor (MK 13 or MK15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate) through unfragmented wildlife habitat than to put one adjacent to already fragmented habitat. They recommend a route that would follow US 277 and I-10 because habitat along these highways has already been fragmented. The route would take only about 16 miles (10%) of unfragmented wildlife habitat. 10% new habitat fragmentation is significantly less than 72% new habitat fragmentation.

As you can see there is ample evidence that PUC staff "preferred" route recommendation MK 15 Modified/MK 15 Alternate is not the best solution as it relates to crossing Tierra Linda Ranch. Therefore I respectfully request that you adopt another route across Tierra Linda Ranch.

Sincerely yours,



John Schattel

John Schattel
10317 Donley Drive
Irving, TX 75063

USA FIRST CLASS FOREVER



POSTED 7/10/03 10:00 AM
07/10/03 10:00 AM
07/10/03 10:00 AM

Commissioner Barry Smitherman, Chair
Texas Public Utility Commission
1701 N. Congress Avenue
P. O. Box 13326
Austin, TX 78711 - 3326

78711332626

